**Center Commissioned External Review (CCER) of Food Legumes**

**Comments from Board Members**

***Henri Carsalade*:** To discuss when he visits. Is comfortable with the terms of reference; agrees it should be conducted in the current crop season. Finds the panel difficult to balance.

***Abdelmajid Slama:*** Found the TOR comprehensive and at same time quite ambitious to address. Some the difficult issues such as point 20 on adequacy of capacity building and regional cooperation, point 19 on direct relevance to modification due to climate change,and point 11on research priorities and feedback from the field realities.

Is convinced the question 2 (What is the relevance of the Program's research activities within the CGIAR System wide research priorities? And what is their relevance to the new MPs structure of the CGIAR System) should be included in the TOR. My interpretation of the question is that there is a doubt within ICARDA management and the BOT on the relevance of the current and future research on food legumes.

Among the 6 candidates, I consider the following three are the best qualified without taking into consideration the need for geographical balance: Dr. Ana Maria Torres, Dr. Frederick Muehlbauer and Dr. Albert Vandenberg.

***Fawzi Sultan:*** No comments on TOR. On the Panel members suggest Ana Maria Torres, Massod Ali and Muehlbauer.

***Camilla Toulmin:***

* It would be helpful to get a sense of where legumes fit within the bigger food security picture and how this might shift over time.
* If addressing climate change requires that we develop lower carbon/greenhouse gas emitting farming systems, do legumes have a particularly valuable role to play here because of their N fixing properties?
* What is the balance of funding of R&D on food legumes between private and public sector agencies? Is this different from some of the other major crops, and what implications for ICARDA's strategy?
* Can the review also tell us more about the relevance of legumes for addressing poverty, and the nutritional needs of the poorest?
* Are there specific gender implications associated with legume farming, and food preparation/consumption which need to be considered?

As to the Panel, has problems about hiring a husband-wife team. They may well be the best, but it's a question of how it might be interpreted. Hence, would propose Dr Massod Ali, Dr Snobar and either Muehlbauer or Cubero or Torres.

***Carl-Gustaf Thornström:*** Having read comments from others, has little to add. A minor remark at this stage: concerns the concept of ´varieties´ released by the program. Is this concept referring to biologically distinct features (i.e. UPOV NDUS-criteria -finished varieties) or more referring to improved germplasm? And further: will issues like local seed production including emerging private sector efforts and NARS´ public plant breeding capacities be covered in the CCER? No specific preference on Panel members. Agrees should not have spouses.

***John Coleman:*** The questions that panel would be asked to address are very complete and relevant. I appreciate Camilla's commentary on them and hope that the matters that she raises will receive attention. As to the panel, would favour some gender balance, persons still active in their career, and persons who come from the ICARDA heartland. This leads me to suggest Torres, Vandenburg and Snobar.

***Paul Steffen:*** No additional comments to those already made.

***Walid Tawil:*** Suggests the following candidates: Cubero, Massod Ali, Bassam Snobar

***Mona Bishay:***

* **It will be useful if the time horizon of the research reviewed be clearly specified. Will the CCER review only ongoing research activities on food legumes ( post the EPMR of 2006 and the CCER of 2005 ?)  or also some completed ones of older vintage? Judging from question 9 in the TORs on the extent of quantification of research impact it looks like the review is expected to** look **at completed research as well . How far back is this impact tracing expected to extend? It will be more useful for future directions if the subject matter of the investigation about impact quantification..etc is the relatively more recent research, not those formulated and conducted under older strategic orientation for ICARDA and its major partners.**
* **Food legumes in the dry areas of North Africa and West Asia are traditionally an integral part of the livelihood of the rural poor households and an essential component of their survival strategies. However, the sharp oscillation of food prices and the change in relative prices including input/output prices) due to international economic events (financial crisis, etc.) may have changed the relative profitability of these crops and influenced their role in food security and income of the poor. It will be useful if the review can shed some light on this aspect and its implications for future research. The importance of incorporating economic risk management is a case in point.**
* **ICARDA's Strategic Plan 07-16 states that its research agenda should be ... "multi-institutional, multi disciplinary, participatory, implemented with farmers and spans the entire research-development continuum, ensuring that research results translate into tangible benefits at farm level”. The TOR questions do request the team to verify some of these characteristics in the food legumes research, but overlook some others (see below).**
* **To fully verify the stipulations of ICARDA's Strategic Plan 07-16, point 16  can be  expanded to include the extent to which food legumes research is  multidisciplinary, i.e. whether it  has incorporated socio-economic, gender differentiation and policy aspects related to the legumes farming system to improve research targeting, adoption  and poverty impact.**
* **To the same effect, point 12 can be expanded to include the extent to which food legume research has been designed and conducted within a participatory framework with all partners and stakeholders including the small farmers.**
* **Finally, the TOR do not allude to the efficiency of the food legumes research programs. Would it be feasible to include one question relating to the adequacy of program resources and the efficiency of its utilization and program financial management?**

**On the Team composition: suggests Dr. Ana Maria Torres, Dr. Masood Ali, and Dr. Fred. Muehlbauer or Dr. Bassam Snobar. Given the stipulations of ICARDA Strategic Plan 07/16 , it will be pertinent and useful if an agricultural socio-economist with expertise in the food legumes farming systems can be identified to join the team.**

***Michel Afram:*** agrees with Mona Bishay on the team composition (Torres, Massod Ali, Muehlbauer or Snobar). Agrees the CCER should to take place in the current crop season.

**Panel Members**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | **Votes** |
| 1. Dr. Joseph I. Cubero, CIFA Alameda del Obispo, Córdoba, Spain. | **2** |
| 1. Dr. Ana Maria Torres, IFAPA-CICE, Spain | **6** |
| *(NOTE: candidates 1 and 2 are spouses)* |  |
| 1. Dr. Massod Ali, Ex-Director, Indian Institute of Pulses, ICAR, India | **5** |
| 1. Dr. Frederick J Muehlbauer, Grain Legume Genetics Physiology Research Collaborator, USDA/Washington State University, Pullman, Washington, USA | **5** |
| 1. Dr. Albert Vandenberg, Crop Development Center, University of Saskatchewan, Canada | **2** |
| 1. Dr. Bassam Snobar, Professor of Agricultural Engineering, University of Jordan *(with specific experience in mechanization of legume crops)* | **5** |